



ELECTRYONE
ΗΛΕΚΤΡΥΩΝΗ

ISSN 2241-4061



9 772241 406118

*Andrej Kalaš and Vladislav Suvák, Antisthenis
Fragmenta/Antisthenove zlomky. Bratislava,
2013. 33,44 €. Pp. 542. Paperback. ISBN
9788022334471*

Reviewed by: Igor Deraj
University of Prešov in Prešov
deraj.igor@yahoo.com

The Comenius University Press has published *Antisthenis Fragmenta* (2013) in an impression limited to 100 copies. The book contains a corpus of extant fragments and sources of Antisthenes' thought and maps the most important interpretations and commentaries on Antisthenes. In this publication, Andrej Kalaš introduces his Slovak translation of Greek and Latin texts of Giannantoni's complete edition of Antisthenes' fragments (*Socratis et Socraticorum Reliquiae*. Naples, Bibliopolis, 1990, Vol. II, pp. 137-181: V A. – Antisthenes Atheniensis) not ignoring and relying also upon few other well-known critical editions of the ancient authors, foremost the Marcovich's edition of *Diogenes Laertius (Vitae philosophorum, Vol. I.: Libri I-X; Vol. II.: Excerpta Byzantina, Stuttgart and Leipzig, B. G. Teubner, 1999, pp. i + 826, 346)*.

The *Antisthenis Fragmenta* edition, together with the extensive commentaries of fragments and a brief introductory study (in Slovak) *A short companion to the life and work of Socratic Antisthenes/Stručný sprievodca životom a dielom sókratovca Antisthena* (pp. 9-27), was elaborated by Vladislav Suvák. The corpus of Antisthenes's fragments is supplemented by the photographic material depicting ancient works of art which was retrieved from the free media repository server Wikimedia Commons, the archive Fratelli Alinari, and Faust Zeví's private archive. This additional material makes the reading experience even more aesthetically welcoming.

The authors mention that their aim was to prepare an edition of the first Slovak translation of the *Fragmenta* not excluding the most important commentaries and interpretations of Antisthenes since 19th century up to present (p. 7). Their cooperative work on the fragments of Antisthenes had already begun in 2007. The title *Antisthenis Fragmenta* represents in fact a continuation and further elaboration of the first book of Andrej Kalaš and Vladislav Suvák devoted to the same subject (*Antisthenés*. 2010. Bratislava: Kalligram). In comparison with their first publication, in the current book, Andrej Kalaš has edited and slightly corrected the Slovak translation of some of the fragments and few other in Greek and Latin were also added based on the Giannantoni's, resp. some other critical editions. Authors themselves indicate what could be seen as the book's contribution to the current research in philology and history of philosophy. Up to these days, the fragments of Antisthenes have been translated only into four modern languages (German, Russian, Modern Greek, and French), but none of the editions was complete (p. 7). The translation of Andrej Kalaš thus remains only the sixth in the order of translations of Antisthenes' fragments into modern languages and becomes at the same time the first complete translation of Antisthenes' fragments based on the Giannantoni's edition.

This edition contains, together with the *Appendix I.*, 208 fragments. Two of them are actually not fragments, but rather coherent writings recording Antisthenes' Socratic speeches *Ajax or Ajax's speech* (Αἶας ἢ Αἴαντος λόγος) [= SSR VA 53] and *Odysseus or on Odysseus* (Ὀδυσσεύς ἢ περὶ Ὀδυσσέως) [= SSR VA 54]. In *Antisthenis Fragmenta*, Andrej Kalaš and Vladislav Suvák (pp. 497-498) extend Giannantoni's edition, adding

the *Appendix II.*, which includes the fragment 176 Caizzi (= fr. 145 Paquet). This publication has a potential to be received by those interested in ancient philosophy and philology as an interesting study and research material. In spite of the fragmentariness and incompleteness of the extant evidence and the related ancient or later discussions, it is still not irrelevant to opine that the influence of Antisthenes' thought did not have to be much lesser in his times than that of Plato or Aristotle. Even in the two abovementioned speeches, the scope of Antisthenes' thought reaches many diverse fields of human praxis. Despite the argumentation of both speakers is loaded with Gorgianic and Prodician features and motifs, it does not only present the patterns for later forensic rhetoric. Antisthenes' adaptation of Homeric motifs and his depiction of literary figures of Ajax and Odysseus reach also a remarkable level of originality.

Despite their supposedly shared conception of knowledge (ἐπιστήμη), Antisthenes most probably disagreed with some of Plato's important views on the nature of language and thought. The book *Antisthenis Fragmenta* could thus bring many new impulses and motivations for the students of history of philosophy in relation to the so called "sophistic" which could open new perspective for the investigation of this "diverse" movement. One of the fragments originating from Epictetus mentions Antisthenes' method of "investigation of names" [= SSR VA 160] indicating that Antisthenes, similarly to the sophist Prodicus, could have held that the proper use of speech is necessary for proper acting. Other fragments of Antisthenes, described as "logical" by a significant majority of the interpreters and appearing mostly in an Aristotelian, resp. Peripatetic context [e.g. SSR VA 150; SSR VA 152; SSR VA 153 etc.], concerning e.g. the "impossibility of gainsaying", or the "impossibility of predication", could attract the attention of logicians and perhaps students of the systematic branches of philosophy. Readers interested in tracing Antisthenes' ties to ancient Greek cynicism, may find amazing the fragments concerning Antisthenes' conception of virtue (ἀρετή) [e.g. SSR VA 134], self-sufficiency (αὐτάρκεια) [e.g. SSR VA 171] or other ethical problems. The book *Antisthenis Fragmenta/Antisthenove Zlomky* could easily find it's addressee among the readers' community and Socratic scholars mostly in the Czech and Slovak language environment, and perhaps also in the wider public, e.g. in the discourse of literary science.

WORKS CITED:

Giannantoni, Gabriele. 1990. *Socratis et Socraticorum Reliquiae, 4 Vols.* Naples: Bibliopolis.

Kalaš, Andrej and Suvák, Vladislav. 2010. *Antisthenés.* Bratislava: Kalligram.

Marcovich, Miroslav. 1999. *Diogenis Laertii Vitae philosophorum, 2 Vols.* Stuttgart & Leipzig: B.G. Teubner.

Paquet, Léonce. 1992. *Les Cyniques grecs: fragments et témoignages.* Paris: Le Livre de Poche.

I.D.